



Host jumps shaped the diversity of extant rust fungi (Pucciniales)

Alistair R. McTaggart¹, Roger G. Shivas², Magriet A. van der Nest³, Jolanda Roux⁴, Brenda D. Wingfield³ and Michael J. Wingfield¹

¹Department of Microbiology and Plant Pathology, Tree Protection Co-operative Programme (TPCP), Forestry and Agricultural Biotechnology Institute (FABI), University of Pretoria, Private Bag X20, Pretoria 0028, South Africa; ²Department of Agriculture and Forestry, Queensland Plant Pathology Herbarium, GPO Box 267, Brisbane, Qld 4001, Australia; ³Department of Genetics, Forestry and Agricultural Biotechnology Institute (FABI), University of Pretoria, Private bag X20, Pretoria 0028, South Africa; ⁴Department of Plant Sciences, Tree Protection Co-operative Programme (TPCP), Forestry and Agricultural Biotechnology Institute (FABI), University of Pretoria, Private Bag X20, Pretoria 0028, South Africa

Summary

Author for correspondence: Alistair R. McTaggart Tel: +2712 420 6714 Email: alistair.mctaggart@gmail.com

Received: 8 July 2015 Accepted: 26 August 2015

New Phytologist (2016) **209:** 1149–1158 **doi**: 10.1111/nph.13686

Key words: calibration, host jumps, host–parasite evolution, Mikronegeriaceae, molecular dating, Pucciniales, Uredinales. • The aim of this study was to determine the evolutionary time line for rust fungi and date key speciation events using a molecular clock. Evidence is provided that supports a contemporary view for a recent origin of rust fungi, with a common ancestor on a flowering plant.

• Divergence times for > 20 genera of rust fungi were studied with Bayesian evolutionary analyses. A relaxed molecular clock was applied to ribosomal and mitochondrial genes, calibrated against estimated divergence times for the hosts of rust fungi, such as *Acacia* (Fabaceae), angiosperms and the cupressophytes.

• Results showed that rust fungi shared a most recent common ancestor with a mean age between 113 and 115 million yr. This dates rust fungi to the Cretaceous period, which is much younger than previous estimations. Host jumps, whether taxonomically large or between host genera in the same family, most probably shaped the diversity of rust genera. Likewise, species diversified by host shifts (through coevolution) or via subsequent host jumps. This is in contrast to strict coevolution with their hosts.

• *Puccinia psidii* was recovered in Sphaerophragmiaceae, a family distinct from Raveneliaceae, which were regarded as confamilial in previous studies.

Introduction

Rust fungi (Pucciniales, Pucciniomycotina) are the most species rich group of obligate, plant pathogenic fungi. They include many important plant pathogens such as Puccinia graminis (wheat stem rust), Hemileia vastatrix (coffee rust) and Cronartium ribicola (white pine blister rust). The divergence of rust fungi was thought to mirror the evolution of their host plants (Savile, 1976, 1979; Anikster & Wahl, 1979). Thus, ancestral species of rust have been considered pathogens of ferns (monilophytes) and gymnosperms, with succession to angiosperms (Cunningham, 1931; Leppik, 1953, 1965; Savile, 1976). Leppik (1965) hypothesized that the first ancestor of rust fungi may have evolved 200-300 million yr ago (Ma) on mosses (bryophytes) and ancient ferns (leptosporangiates, which excludes the Polypodiales), and have extant relatives in the genera Eocronartium and Jola (Platygloeales, Pucciniomycotina). This correlates with the evolutionary divergence times for ferns, gymnosperms and angiosperms at c. 394, 312 and 194 Ma (Magallón et al., 2013).

Hart (1988) challenged the notion that ancestral hosts harbored ancestral parasites. This was based on a phylogenetic analysis with morphological characters from 30 genera of rust fungi. Hart (1988) suggested that ancestral rusts were autoecious (completed their life cycle on one host), short-cycled and evolved on angiosperms in tropical climates. He further proposed that the rusts on ferns and pines (Pinales) were derived, and groups now classified as the suborders Uredinineae *sensu* Aime (2006) and Melampsorineae *sensu* Aime (2006) diverged at the same time. Sjamsuridzal *et al.* (1999) determined that fern rusts were not ancestral in the Pucciniales with a molecular phylogenetic study that supported the conclusions of Hart (1988).

An evolutionary origin of rust fungi on angiosperms was supported by Aime (2006), who showed that some extant species, including *H. vastatrix* (on Rubiaceae), *Blastospora smilacis* (on Smilacaceae) and *Maravalia cryptostegiae* (on Apocynaceae), belonged to an ancestral family, Mikronegeriaceae (Pucciniales). This family is typified by *Mikronegeria*, which is heteroecious on gymnosperms and *Nothofagus* (Nothofagaceae, Fagales), or, in the case of *M. fuchsiae*, on a gymnosperm and *Fuchsia* (Onagraceae) (Crane & Peterson, 2007).

The most ancestral member of the Pucciniales recovered by Aime (2006) was *Caeoma torreyae* on a gymnosperm, *Torreya californica* (Taxaceae, Pinales). Peterson (1974) first proposed that *C. torreyae* was an ancestral rust that existed in the Mesozoic or early Cenozoic, between 66 and 250 Ma. *C. torreyae* occurs on *Torreya*, which diverged *c.* 138 Ma (Magallón *et al.*, 2013). The divergence time of the cupressophytes, which include *Torreya* and the aecial hosts of *Mikronegeria*, namely *Araucaria* and *Austrocedrus*, was estimated at 257 Ma (Magallón *et al.*, 2013). Estimates for the age of rust fungi have varied considerably. Wingfield *et al.* (2004) estimated that rust fungi evolved as recently as 150 Ma on primitive angiosperms. This estimation was based on a set rate of nucleotide changes in the small subunit (SSU) region of ribosomal DNA. However, Aime (2006) estimated that rusts were an older group, *c.* 250 Ma, as this was similar to the ages of Araucariaceae and Taxaceae, and predated the break-up of the supercontinent Pangaea *c.* 138–160 Ma (Mao *et al.*, 2012).

A difficulty for molecular dating of fungi is the lack of fossil evidence used to calibrate divergence times for extant lineages (Berbee & Taylor, 2010). This is the case for rust fungi (Pucciniales), which are obligate pathogens and are mostly represented by fossils up to 70 Ma (Tiffney & Barghoorn, 1974; Savile, 1976). The underlying assumption of the present study is that the estimated times of host divergence, based on fossil evidence, provide a calibration point for the divergence times of parasites that share a coevolutionary relationship.

The aim of this study was to determine the evolutionary time line for the rust fungi and to date key speciation events with a molecular clock. The divergence dates of extant groups of rust fungi have never been studied with a molecular clock calibrated to definitive points in time. A Bayesian dating approach with three gene regions from ribosomal DNA and mitochondrial DNA was used to estimate the ages of monophyletic groups of rust fungi. The divergence times calculated in this study shed light on the common mechanisms for speciation in rust fungi.

Materials and Methods

Taxon selection

Representative species were selected from genera for which there are sequence data on GenBank for the large subunit (LSU) and SSU regions of ribosomal DNA (rDNA), and cytochrome c oxidase subunit 3 (CO3) of mitochondrial DNA (Table 1). Sequence data for tropical rust fungi on angiosperms obtained in a study on Australian rust fungi (Shivas *et al.*, 2014) were included and uploaded to GenBank (Table 1). These genera included *Achrotelium, Ceratocoma, Coleosporium, Cystopsora, Hemileia, Phragmidium, Sphaerophragmium, Thekopsora* and *Uromyces*.

Phylogenetic analyses

The SSU, LSU and CO3 sequences were aligned with the MAFFT algorithm (Katoh *et al.*, 2009) in SATe-II (Liu *et al.*, 2012). *Eocronartium* and *Helicobasidium* were selected as outgroup taxa based on the phylogenetic study by Aime (2006). The three alignments were concatenated and run as partitioned datasets with maximum likelihood and Bayesian inference as phylogenetic criteria. GTRGAMMA was specified as the model of evolution in both criteria. Maximum likelihood was implemented as a search criterion in RAxML (Stamatakis, 2014). The RAxML analyses were run with a rapid Bootstrap analysis (command -f a) using a random starting tree and 1000 maximum likelihood bootstrap replicates. A Markov chain Monte

Carlo search in a Bayesian analysis was conducted with MrBayes (Ronquist & Huelsenbeck, 2003). Four runs, each consisting of four chains, were implemented for 2.6 million generations until the standard deviation of split frequencies was < 0.008. The cold chain was heated at a temperature of 0.25. Substitution model parameters were sampled every 1000 generations and trees were saved every 1000 generations. Convergence of the Bayesian analysis was confirmed using AWTY (Nylander *et al.*, 2008) (available at: ceb.csit.fsu.edu/awty/). A burn-in of 25% was used and 8000 trees were summarized for the final topology. The maximum likelihood and Bayesian analyses were run three times to test accuracy. Alignments and trees were uploaded to TreeBASE (http://purl.org/phylo/treebase/phylows/study/TB2:S17850).

Molecular dating analyses

Bayesian evolutionary analysis by sampling trees was implemented in BEAST 2 (Bouckaert et al., 2014), which allowed estimation of the divergence times of monophyletic groups of rust fungi from their most recent common ancestors. The LSU, SSU and CO3 regions were run as separate partitions with $GTR + I + \Gamma$ and HKY as substitution site models, a gamma category count of four, and estimated parameters. A lognormal relaxed clock, which proposes that nucleotide changes occur at variable rates within lineages or in particular genes, was used as the clock model, and the Yule model was used as a tree prior for a constant birth-death, which is appropriate for trees with different species (Drummond & Bouckaert, 2015). Outgroups used in the phylogenetic analyses were excluded from the BEAST analyses as recommended by Drummond & Bouckaert (2015). A congruent topology obtained from maximum likelihood and Bayesian inference was fixed as a topology for the BEAST analyses. Two separate BEAST analyses that differed at the calibration of Pucciniales were run for 30 million generations, with trees logged every 1000 generations. TRACER v.1.6.0 (Rambaut et al., 2014) was used to determine the behavior of the chains and to test the confidence of estimated parameters with the effective sample sizes (ESS). The mean node ages and 95% highest posterior density (HPD) values were summarized and annotated on the final topologies with TREEANNOTATOR v2.2.0 (Drummond et al., 2012).

Calibration of nodes

Nodes were calibrated in BEAUTi 2 (Bouckaert *et al.*, 2014) based on mean divergence times for the hosts of rust fungi. A normal distribution was selected for the data as recommended by Ho (2007) and Drummond & Bouckaert (2015). The age of the rust node was calibrated so the mean age of host divergence was the maximum age in the 97.5% quantile of the distribution of the prior (priors are defined in Table 2 and calibrated nodes are shown in Fig. 1). This is weighted to host-tracking rather than cospeciation, and assumes a lag time between the evolution of the parasite and its host (Roy, 2001). Nodes within *Endoraecium* were calibrated based on evidence that these rusts coevolved with

1469

, Dov

nloaded from https://nph.onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1111/nph.13686 by Research Information Service, Wiley Online Library on [13.022024]. See the Terms and Conditions (https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/erms

-and-conditions) on Wiley Online Library for rules of use; OA articles are governed by the applicable Creative Commons License

Table 1 Species of rust, specimen number, host and GenBank numbers of taxa included in the analyses

	Specimen	Host of specimen	GenBank number		
Taxon			LSU	SSU	CO3
Achrotelium ichnocarpi Syd.	BRIP 55634	Ichnocarpus frutescens	KT199393	KT199381	KT199404
<i>Caeoma torreyae</i> Bonar		Torreya californica	AF522183 ¹	AY123284 ²	NA
Ceratocoma jacksoniae	BRIP 57762	<i>Davesia</i> sp.	KT199394	KT199382	KT199405
(Henn. ex McAlpine) Buriticá & J.F. Hennen			_		_
Chrysomyxa cassandrae (Gobi) Tranzschel	NA	Picea glauca	FJ666455 ³	NA	FJ666432 ³
<i>Chrysomyxa ledi</i> (Alb. & Schwein.) de Bary	DAOM 149959	Rhododendron palustre	FJ666468 ³	NA	FJ666445 ³
Chrysomyxa ledicola Lagerh.	NA	Rhododendron groenlandicum	FJ666446 ³	NA	FJ666423 ³
Chrysomyxa nagodhii P.E. Crane	NA	Picea mariana	FJ666461 ³	NA	FJ666438 ³
Chrysomyxa pyrolae Rostr.	NA	Pyrola sp.	FJ6664663	NA	FJ666443 ³
Coleosporium tussilaginis (Pers.) Lév.	BRIP 56944	Senecio sp.	KT199395	KT199383	KT199406
Cystopsora notelaeae Syd.	BRIP 58325	Notelaea microcarpa	KT199396	KT199384	KT199407
Dasyspora amazonica Beenken	BPI 0116382	Xylopia amazonica	JF2634604	JF2634964	JF2635124
Dasyspora echinata Beenken & Berndt	PUR N6196	Xylopia emarginata	JF2634624	JF263497 ⁴	JF263513 ⁴
Dasyspora gregaria (Kunze) Henn.	ZT Myc 3397	Xylopia cayennensis	JF2634774	JF2635024	JF2635184
Dasyspora guianensis Beenken	ZT Myc 3413	Xylopia benthamii	JF2634794	JF2635034	JF2635194
Dasyspora mesoamericana Beenken	PUR 42390	Xylopia frutescens var. frutescens	JF263480 ⁴	JF263504*	JF263520 ⁺
Dasyspora nitidae Beenken	ZT Myc 3409	Xylopia nitida	JF2634844	JF2635054	JF263521 ⁴
Dasyspora segregaria Beenken	PMA MP4941	Xylopia aromatica	JF2634884	JF2635074	JF2635234
Dasyspora winteri (Pazschke) Beenken	S F30078	Xylopia sericea	JF263492 ⁴	JF263508 ⁴	JF263524 ⁴
Endoraecium acaciae Hodges & D.E. Gardner	BPI 871098	Acacia koa	DQ323916 [°]	DQ323917°	NA
Endoraecium auriculiforme McTaggart & R.G. Shivas	BRIP 56548	Acacia auriculiformis	KJ862298°	NA	KJ862432°
Endoraecium carnegiei McTaggart & R.G. Shivas	BRIP 57924	Acacia dealbata	KJ862301°	NA	KJ862435°
Endoraecium disparrimum McTaggart & R.G. Shivas	BRIP 55626	Acacia disparrima	KJ862304°	KJ862403°	KJ862437°
Endoraecium falciforme McTaggart & R.G. Shivas	BRIP 57583	Acacia falciformis	KJ862306°	KJ862405°	KJ862439°
Endoraecium irroratum McLaggart & R.G. Shivas	BRIP 57286	Acacia irrorata	KJ862312°	KJ862407°	KJ862442°
Endoraecium koae (Arthur) M. Scholler & Aime	BPI 8/10/1	Acacia koa	DQ323918	DQ323919	NA
Endoraecium masiinii McTaggart & R.G. Shivas	BRIP 57872	Acacia daphnifolia	KJ862314	KJ862408 ⁻	KJ862444
Endoraecium parvum Bernot	BRIP 57524	Acacia lelocalyx	KJ862316 ⁻	KJ862409°	KJ862445°
Endoraecium phyllodiorum (Pork, & Proome) Porndt	BRIP 33602	Acacia noiosencia	KJ862308	INA 1/10/2011/16	KJ862440
Endoraccium polynouloium (berk. & Broome) Bernut	DRIP 37310	Acacia podaluriifolia	NJ002524	KJ002411 KI062414 ⁶	KJ002447
Endoraecium tiernevi	BDID 27071	Acacia pouaryimona	K18623356	K1862/15 ⁶	K1862449
(1 Walker & R.G. Shivas) M. Scholler & Aime	DI(II 27071	Ατατία Παιρορηγίια	KJ002333	1002415	1002400
Endorancium tronicum McTaggart & P.C. Shivas	BDID 56557	Acacia tropica	K1862337 ⁶	K1862/117 ⁶	K1862452 ⁶
Endoraecium violae-faustiae Berndt	BRIP 55601	Acacia aulacocarpa	K1862338 ⁶	K1862417	K1862452
Encronartium muscicola (Pers.) Fitzp	NA	NA	AF014825 ¹	DO241438 ⁷	NA
Gerwasia rubi Racib	BRIP 58369	Rubus sp	KT199397	NA	KT199408
Hamaspora acutissima P Svd & Svd	BRIP 55606	Rubus moluccanus	KT199398	KT199385	KT199409
Helicobasidium purpureum (Tul.) Pat.	TUB 011542	Carpinus betulus	AY254180 ⁸	D85648 ⁹	NA
Hemileia vastatrix Berk. & Broome	BRIP 61233	Coffea robusta	KT199399	DQ354565 ¹⁰	KT199410
Hemileia sp.	BRIP 57470	Rubiaceae	KT199400	KT199386	KT199411
Maravalia cryptostegiae (Vestergr.) Y. Ono	BRIP 56898	Cryptostegia grandiflora	KT199401	KT199387	KT199412
Masseeëlla capparis (Hobson bis ex Cooke) Dietel	BRIP 56844	Flueggea virosa	JX136798 ¹¹	NA	KT199413
Melampsora abietis-canadensis C.A. Ludw.	NA	Tsuga canadensis	FJ666512 ³	NA	FJ666542 ³
Melampsora aecidioides (DC.) J. Schröt.	NA	Populus alba	FJ666520 ³	NA	FJ666550 ³
Melampsora medusae f.sp. tremuloides Shain	NA	Populus tremuloides	FJ666517 ³	NA	FJ666547 ³
<i>Melampsora pinitorqua</i> Rostr.	NA	Pinus sylvestris	FJ666523 ³	NA	FJ666553 ³
Phakopsora annonae-sylvaticae Beenken	PUR 87311	Annona sylvatica	KF528008 ¹²	KF528038 ¹²	KF528046 ¹²
Phakopsora cherimoliae (Lagerh.) Cummins	NA	Annona cherimola	KF528011 ¹²	KF528040 ¹²	KF528048 ¹²
Phakopsora crucis-filii (Dianese, R.B. Medeiros & L.T.P. Santos) Beenken	ZT Myc 48990	Annona paludosa	KF528016 ¹²	KF528041 ¹²	KF528049 ¹²
Phakopsora myrtacearum McTaggart, Maier, Jol. Roux, M.J. Wingf.	PREM 61155	Eucalyptus grandis	KP729473 ¹³	NA	KT199414
Phakopsora pistila (Buriticá & J.F. Hennen) Beenken	ZT Myc 48992	Annona sericea	KF528026 ¹²	KF528043 ¹²	KF528051 ¹²
Phakopsora rolliniae (W.T. Dale) Beenken	ZT Myc 49000	Annona exsucca	KF528034 ¹²	KF528045 ¹²	KF528054 ¹²
Phragmidium barnardii Plowr. & G. Winter	BRIP 56945	Rubus multibracteatus	KT199402	NA	KT199415
Phragmidium potentillae (Pers.) P. Karst.	BRIP 60089	Acaena novae-zelandiae	KT199403	NA	KT199416
Puccinia lagenophorae Cooke	BRIP 57563	Emilia sonchifolia	KF690696 ¹⁵	KT199388	KT199417

Table 1 (Continued)

Taxon	Specimen	Host of specimen	GenBank number		
			LSU	SSU	CO3
Puccinia myrsiphylli (Thüm.) G. Winter	BRIP 57782	Asparagus asparagoides	KM249854	NA	KT199418
Puccinia psidii G. Winter	BRIP 57793	Rhodamnia angustifolia	KF318449 ¹⁴	KF318457 ¹⁴	KT199419
Puccinia stylidii McAlpine	BRIP 60107	Stylidium armeria	KJ622215 ¹⁵	KT199389	KT199420
Puccinia ursiniae R.G. Shivas	BRIP 57993	Ursinia anthemoides	KF690705 ¹⁵	KT199390	KT199421
Sphaerophragmium acaciae (Cooke) Magnus	BRIP 56910	Albizzia sp.	KJ862350 ⁶	KJ862429 ⁶	KJ862462 ⁶
Sphenorchidium polyalthiae (Syd. & P. Syd.) Beenken & A.R. Wood	ZT HeRB 251	Polyalthia longifolia	JF263493 ⁴	JF2635094	JF263525 ⁴
Thekopsora minima (Arthur) P. Syd. & Syd	BRIP 57654	Vaccinium corymbosum	KC763340 ¹⁶	KT199391	KT199422
Uromyces Iomandracearum J. Walker & van der Merwe	BRIP 59022	Lomandra sp.	KM249862	KT199392	KT199423
Uromycladium acaciae (Cooke) P. Syd. & Syd.	BRIP 60092	Acacia terminalis	KR994853 ¹⁷	KR994932 ¹⁷	KR995046 ¹³
Uromycladium sp.	BRIP 59239	Acacia mearnsii	KR994852 ¹⁷	KR994931 ¹⁷	KR995045 ¹³
Uromycladium falcatarium	BRIP 57447	Falcataria moluccana	KJ632973 ¹⁸	KJ633013 ¹⁸	KJ639059 ¹⁸
Doungsa-ard, McTaggart & R.G. Shivas			19	10	10
Uromycladium fusisporum (Cooke & Massee) Savile	BRIP 57526	Acacia salicina	KJ632991 '°	KJ633031'°	KJ639075 '°
Uromycladium naracoortensis Berndt	MEL 2359562	Acacia iteaphylla	KR994880 ¹⁷	KR99495817	KR995071
Uromycladium notabile (F. Ludw.) McAlpine	BRIP 59234	Acacia dealbata	KJ632992 ¹⁸	KJ633030 ¹⁸	KJ639076 ¹⁸
Uromycladium simplex McAlpine	BRIP 59214	Acacia pycnantha	KJ632990 ¹⁸	KJ633029 ¹⁸	KJ639078 ¹⁸
Uromycladium tepperianum (Sacc.) McAlpine	BRIP 56928	Acacia leiocalyx	KJ632981 ¹⁸	KJ633017 ¹⁸	KJ639073 ¹⁸
Uromycladium tepperianum	BRIP 57860	Acacia saligna	KJ632988 ¹⁸	KJ633027 ¹⁸	KJ639069 ¹⁸

NA, sequences were not available. [Correction added after online publication 13 October 2015: in the 'Host of specimen' column, *Pinus alba* and *Pinus tremuloides*, respectively.] GenBank numbers obtained for this study are shown in bold font. ¹T. D. Bruns & T. M. Szaro (unpublished); ²Wingfield *et al.* (2004); ³Vialle *et al.* (2009); ⁴Beenken *et al.* (2012); ⁵Scholler & Aime (2006); ⁶McTaggart *et al.* (2015); ⁷Henk & Vilgalys (2007); ⁸Lutz *et al.* (2004); ⁹S. Kuninaga (unpublished); ¹⁰Aime (2006); ¹¹Liberato *et al.* (2014); ¹²Beenken (2014); ¹³Maier *et al.* (2015); ¹⁴Pegg *et al.* (2014); ¹⁵McTaggart *et al.* (2014); ¹⁶McTaggart *et al.* (2013); ¹⁷C. Doungsa-ard (unpublished); ¹⁸Doungsa-ard *et al.* (2015). LSU, large subunit region of ribosomal DNA (rDNA); SSU, small subunit region of rDNA; CO3, cytochrome c oxidase subunit 3 of mitochondrial DNA.

their host species in the genus Acacia (McTaggart et al., 2015). The divergence dates for species of Acacia were determined by Miller et al. (2013), and five calibration points were provided for Endoraecium and Uromycladium (21.2 Ma maximum age in 97.5% quantile), and species of Endoraecium monophyletic on subclade Botrycephaleae (7.0 Ma maximum age in 97.5% quantile), Juliflorae (11.0 Ma maximum age in 97.5% quantile) and Plurinerves (10.3 Ma maximum age in 97.5% quantile) (Table 2). The Pucciniales were calibrated to the maximum mean divergence age of angiosperms (193.76 Ma maximum age in 97.5% quantile) determined by Magallón et al. (2013). This calibration is based on a most recent common ancestor of rust fungi evolving on angiosperms (Hart, 1988). A second analysis was made with the Pucciniales calibrated to the divergence age of the cupressophytes, which are hosts of the most ancestral species of rust, C. torreyae and Mikronegeria spp. (Aime, 2006). The cupressophytes were calibrated between 136 and 256 Ma, which included the divergence of Torreya as the lowest age, and the mean age of the cupressophytes determined by Magallón et al. (2013) as the upper age. The .xml files are available from the corresponding author.

Results

Phylogenetic analyses

Bayesian inference and maximum likelihood recovered congruent topologies (Fig. 1). The topologies reflected the familial classification recognized by Aime (2006), who recovered eight phylogenetically supported families. There were three exceptions: the Pucciniastraceae and Sphaerophragmiaceae were recognized as distinct families, and the position of *Uromycladium* was unresolved.

Thekopsora minima was recovered sister to the Melampsoraceae, and its inclusion in the Coleosporiaceae sensu Aime (2006) would make this family polyphyletic. It was treated in the Pucciniastraceae sensu Cummins & Hiratsuka (2003). Puccinia psidii was recovered in Sphaerophragmiaceae sensu Cummins & Hiratsuka (1983), a family distinct from the Raveneliaceae as considered by more recent authors (Cummins & Hiratsuka, 2003; Wingfield et al., 2004). Uromycladium was recovered sister to genera in Phakopsoraceae and Raveneliaceae. Cummins & Hiratsuka (2003) considered Uromycladium a member of the Pileolariaceae, and a monophyletic Pileolariaceae sensu stricto containing Pileolaria and Uromycladium was proposed by Aime (2006). Doungsa-ard et al. (2015) determined that Uromycladium was sister to Pileolariaceae, and the results of the present study indicated that it had an unresolved familial position. Cystopsora notelaeae and Achrotelium ichnocarpi were recovered in an ancestral family of rust fungi, Mikronegeriaceae. This is the first molecular evidence to determine the systematic position of these genera, which were placed in the Pucciniaceae and Chaconiaceae by Cummins & Hiratsuka (2003). Hamaspora and Gerwasia were recovered sister to Phragmidium in Phragmidiaceae, which all occur on members of the Rosaceae. Ceratocoma, which previously had an uncertain familial position, was well resolved within Pucciniaceae.

New Phytologist

 Table 2
 Calibration ages, mean ages of most recent common ancestor (MRCA) and 95% highest posterior density (HPD) ranges for selected clades and taxa

Clade/taxon	Calibration (Ma)	Calibrated to divergence of angiosperms		Calibrated to divergence of cupressophytes	
		Mean age of MRCA (Ma)	95% HPD (Ma)	Mean age of MRCA (Ma)	95% HPD (Ma)
Pucciniales calibrated to mean age of angiosperms	2.5% quantile = 107, 5% quantile = 114, Median = 150, 95% quantile = 186, 97.5% quantile = 193	115.01	78.54–150.01	NA	NA
Pucciniales calibrated to divergence of cupressophytes	2.5% quantile = 136, 5% quantile = 146, Median = 196, 95% quantile = 246, 97.5% quantile = 256	NA	NA	112.92	69.55–160.95
Uromycladium	2.5% quantile = 10.8, 5% quantile = 11.6, Median = 16.0, 95% quantile = 20.4, 97.5% quantile = 21.2	16.71	12.42–21.18	16.26	11.84–20.59
Endoraecium	2.5% quantile = 10.8, 5% quantile = 11.6, Median = 16.0, 95% quantile = 20.4, 97.5% quantile = 21.2	18.52	14.54–22.57	17.96	13.92–22.03
E. auriculiformum E. disparrimum E. parvum E. peggii E. phyllodiorum E. tropicae E. violae-faustiae	2.5% quantile = 7.04, 5% quantile = 7.36, Median = 9.0, 95% quantile = 10.6, 97.5% quantile = 11.0	8.85	7.08–10.68	8.75	6.91–10.55
E. acaciae E. koae E. tierneyi	2.5% quantile = 6.34, 5% quantile = 6.66, Median = 8.3, 95% quantile = 9.94, 97.5% quantile = 10.3	7.38	5.42–9.36	7.37	5.40-9.33
E. carnegiei E. falciforme E. irroratum E. maslinii E. podalyriifolium	2.5% quantile = 1.0, 5% quantile = 1.48, Median = 4.0, 95% quantile = 6.52, 97.5% quantile = 7.0	4.88	2.94–6.91	2.70	1.60–3.84

The mean ages and 95% HPD are provided for two analyses calibrated to the divergence times of angiosperms or cupressophytes.

NA, not applicable. Ma, million yr ago.

Shortened genus E. refers to Endoraecium.

Molecular dating analyses

The BEAST analyses run with GTR + I + Γ as a nucleotide substitution model had ESS values < 200 for the posterior and prior parameters, and rates of nucleotide change when viewed in Tracer. These results were not used in the final estimate of ages because they indicate that the rates of change for GTR had low confidence.

The BEAST analyses run with HKY as a nucleotide substitution model had ESS values > 200 for all parameters when viewed in Tracer. The final topology with mean ages and 95% HPD range was obtained from the HKY analyses (Fig. 2). The 95% HPD values for discussed clades are included in Table 2. The mean node ages were in agreement between the two analyses calibrated to the ages of angiosperms and cupressophytes (Fig. 1). The 95% HPDs were all slightly younger in the analysis calibrated to cupressophytes than that calibrated to angiosperms. The largest difference between the two calibrations occurred for the most recent common ancestor of the Puccinales. The mean age of this node was 115 Ma with 79–150 95% HPD calibrated to angiosperms, and 113 Ma with 70–161 95% HPD calibrated to cupressophytes. These ages were 43 Ma younger than the calibrated mean age for angiosperms and 94 Ma younger than the oldest calibrated age for cupressophytes.



Fig. 1 Phylogram obtained from a maximum likelihood search in RAxML with the large subunit (LSU), small subunit (SSU) and cytochrome c oxidase subunit 3 (CO3) gene regions. Bootstrap values are from 1000 maximum likelihood replicates above nodes and posterior probability values are summarized from 8000 converged trees in a Bayesian search below nodes. This topology was fixed for the BEAST analyses (Fig. 2), and calibrated to the estimated divergence ages of host plants shown at selected nodes. Ma, million yr ago.

Discussion

When rust fungi first evolved and how they diversified into one of the most important groups of plant pathogens with over 8000 described species and 120 genera on ferns, gymnosperms and angiosperms has never been resolved. This is the first study in which a molecular clock has been used to estimate an evolutionary timescale for rust fungi. Our results indicate that rust fungi shared



Fig. 2 Phylogram obtained from a BEAST analysis with the Pucciniales calibrated to the divergence age of the cupressophytes. The mean divergence ages calibrated to cupressophytes are above the node (blue), and those calibrated to angiosperms are below the node (yellow). The 95% highest posterior density (HPD) values calibrated to cupressophytes are above the node (blue), and those calibrated to angiosperms are below the node (yellow). Ma, million yr ago; HPD, highest posterior density.

a most recent common ancestor between 70 and 161 Ma, with a mean age of 113–115 Ma. This is more recent than most other estimates that lie between 150 and 300 Ma (Leppik, 1965; Savile,

1976; Wingfield *et al.*, 2004; Aime, 2006). This revised age provides evidence that host jumps, rather than coevolution, were the main speciation events that drove the evolution of rust fungi.

The divergence ages of 70–161 Ma for rust fungi estimated in this study reflect the host ages of ancestral plant species. For example, the gymnosperm *Torreya* diverged *c*. 137 Ma (Magallón *et al.*, 2013). Its rust, *C. torreyae*, was recovered as sister to all other species of rust and is of uncertain familial position. *Nothofagus*, the telial host of *Mikronegeria*, diverged 13–113 Ma (Sauquet *et al.*, 2012). The aecial stage of *M. fagi* and the aecial rusts *A. balansae* and *A. fragiforme* occur on Araucariaceae, which diverged *c*. 243 Ma (Magallón *et al.*, 2013). These rusts were not included in the present study, but could be ancestral in the Pucciniales, as was first proposed by Aime (2006).

The earliest probable fossil record of a rust was recorded in the Pennsylvanian period (299–323 Ma) by Tiffney & Barghoorn (1974), which is not consistent with the findings of the current study. This fossil was identified as a species of *Teleutosporites* (*Uromyces*) on *Lepidodendron*, an extinct club moss. Based on the estimated age of rust fungi here and on host taxonomy, this species could be a member of the Platygloeales (Pucciniomycotina), which parasitize species of moss and are sister to the Pucciniales (Aime *et al.*, 2006). Leppik (1965) and Hennen & Buriticá (1980) considered these fungi as extant ancestors of rust fungi, with unexpanded life cycles.

The revised age for rust fungi found in this study dictates that host jumps, rather than coevolution, were the main speciation events that drove the diversification of rust fungi on angiosperms, gymnosperms and ferns between 70 and 161 Ma. The reasoning is that the mean divergence ages of these plant hosts are between 194 and 394 Ma, and rust fungi were simply not present at that time. Hart (1988) first hypothesized that host jumps drove the diversification of rust fungi. Genera of rust fungi probably arose from host jump events and then diversified by cospeciation or taxonomically small host shifts. Strict examples of coevolution are seen in species of Endoraecium that infect Acacia (McTaggart et al., 2015) and between genera in the Phragmidiaceae on hosts in Roseaceae, as shown in the present study. Host jumps were seen in genera such as Phakopsora (Maier et al., 2015), Puccinia (van der Merwe et al., 2008; McTaggart et al., 2014) and Uromycladium (Doungsa-ard et al., 2015), and within genera of the Mikronegeriaceae and Sphaerophragmiaceae, as seen in the present study. These findings support the hypothesis that hosts and their parasites are not always the result of long term coevolution (de Vienne et al., 2013).

The results of the present study show that families, genera and species of rust fungi within the two suborders Uredinineae *sensu* Aime (2006) and Melampsorineae *sensu* Aime (2006) diverged *c*. 38–46, 22–37 and 0.3–17 Ma, respectively. This was not consistent with a study on the time tree of life (Hedges *et al.*, 2015), which estimated that families, genera and species in the Basidiomycotina diverged *c*. 111, 98 and 6 Ma, respectively (Hedges *et al.*, 2015). Hedges *et al.* (2015) determined that speciation was clock-like. However, parasites have shorter generations and can make taxonomically large host jumps, which means that less time is required for speciation.

The nature of the compatible reactions that have allowed rust fungi to make large jumps between taxonomically diverse hosts is not known. There are well known pathways of host jumps for rust fungi between pines and ferns (Savile, 1979), Ranunculales and Poales (van der Merwe *et al.*, 2008), Asterales and Cyperaceae (van der Merwe *et al.*, 2008), and Annonaceae and Myrtaceae (Maier *et al.*, 2015). Savile (1971) considered that ecological proximity was another requirement for successful host jumps. A genomic approach that compares genes in closely related species that have lost or gained a life cycle stage (e.g. rusts related by Tranzschel's law) or changed hosts may shed light on the requirements for compatible host–parasite interactions.

Rust fungi are mostly host-specific, and this has been a basic assumption for descriptions of new taxa. Molecular phylogenetic studies have shown that narrow host ranges are common for rust fungi. But there are some notable exceptions, such as in the cases of Puccinia lagenophorae (Scholler et al., 2011) and Uromycladium notabile (C. Doungsa-ard, unpublished) on multiple species, and P. psidii on multiple genera (Pegg et al., 2014). The aecial stages of heteroecious rust fungi considered in this study, namely Coleosporium, Chrysomyxa and Thekopsora, are confined to one or two host genera, with a wider host range observed in the telial stage (Cummins & Hiratsuka, 2003). Baum & Savile (1985) highlighted the frequency of host jumps that heteroecious rusts make when they alternate hosts each year. Perhaps there is more plasticity in the host range of rust fungi, particularly in the telial stage, and when rusts are exposed to novel host populations that have not developed resistance. An example is a plastic aecial rust, Cronartium ribicola, which was introduced to North America and spread to native species of Pinus (Kinloch, 2003).

Rust fungi are a species-rich and important group of plant pathogens worldwide. This study has shown that rust fungi evolved in a much shorter time period than was previously estimated. Host jumps explain how rust fungi have become widespread pathogens on a wide variety of plants in < 160 Ma. There are various practical implications. For example, narrow host specificity is a tacit requirement, if not assumption, for the use of rust fungi as biological control agents. In light of evidence showing that rust fungi have diversified by frequent host jumps, biological control programs may need to apply greater amounts of caution before rusts are introduced into naïve ecosystems.

Acknowledgements

We thank the members of the Tree Protection Co-operative Programme (TPCP), the THRIP initiative of the Department of Trade and Industry, and the Department of Science and Technology (DST)/National Research Foundation (NRF) Centre of Excellence in Tree Health Biotechnology (CTHB) for financial assistance that made this study possible. This work was partly funded by the Australian Biological Resources Study, grant number RFL212-33. The authors also thank anonymous reviewers whose suggestions helped to improve the submitted manuscript.

Author contributions

A.R.M. and M.J.W. planned and designed the research. A.R.M., M.A.vdN. and R.G.S. performed experiments, and analysed data.

A.R.M., R.G.S., M.A.vdN., J.R., B.D.W. and M.J.W. wrote the manuscript.

References

- Aime MC. 2006. Toward resolving family-level relationships in rust fungi (Uredinales). *Mycoscience* 47: 112–122.
- Aime MC, Matheny PB, Henk DA, Frieders EM, Nilsson RH, Piepenbring M, McLaughlin DJ, Szabo LJ, Begerow D, Sampaio JP et al. 2006. An overview of the higher level classification of Pucciniomycotina based on combined analyses of nuclear large and small subunit rDNA sequences. Mycologia 98: 896–905.
- Anikster Y, Wahl I. 1979. Coevolution of the rust fungi on Gramineae and Liliaceae and their hosts. *Annual Review of Phytopathology* 17: 367–403.
- Baum BR, Savile DBO. 1985. Rusts (Uredinales) of Triticeae: evolution and extent of coevolution, a cladistic analysis. *Botanical Journal of the Linnean Society* 91: 367–394.
- Beenken L. 2014. Pucciniales on Annona (Annonaceae) with special focus on the genus Phakopsora. Mycological Progress 13: 791–809.
- Beenken L, Zoller S, Berndt R. 2012. Rust fungi on Annonaceae II: the genus Dasyspora Berk. & M.A. Curtis. Mycologia 104: 659–681.
- Berbee ML, Taylor JW. 2010. Dating the molecular clock in fungi how close are we? *Fungal Biology Reviews* 24: 1–16.
- Bouckaert R, Heled J, Kühnert D, Vaughan T, Wu C-H, Xie D, Suchard MA, Rambaut A, Drummond AJ. 2014. BEAST 2: a software platform for Bayesian evolutionary analysis. *PLoS Computational Biology* **10**: e1003537.
- Crane PE, Peterson RS. 2007. *Mikronegeria fuchsiae* sp. nov., a rust fungus on Fuchsia and Phyllocladus in New Zealand. *New Zealand Journal of Botany* 45: 707–713.
- Cummins GB, Hiratsuka Y. 1983. *Illustrated genera of rust fungi, 2nd edn.* St. Paul, MN, USA: American Phytopathological Society.
- **Cummins GB, Hiratsuka Y. 2003.** *Illustrated genera of rust fungi, 3rd edn.* St Paul, MN, USA: American Phytopathological Society.
- Cunningham GH. 1931. The rust fungi of New Zealand: together with the biology, cytology and therapeutics of the Uredinales. Dunedin, New Zealand: John McIndoe.
- Doungsa-ard C, McTaggart AR, Geering ADW, Dalisay TU, Ray J, Shivas RG. 2015. Uromycladium falcatarium sp. nov., the cause of gall rust on Paraserianthes falcataria in south-east Asia. Australasian Plant Pathology 44: 25–30.
- Drummond AJ, Bouckaert RR. 2015. Bayesian evolutionary analysis with BEAST. Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press.
- Drummond AJ, Suchard MA, Xie D, Rambaut A. 2012. Bayesian phylogenetics with BEAUti and the BEAST 1.7. *Molecular Biology and Evolution* 29: 1969– 1973.
- Hart JA. 1988. Rust fungi and host plant coevolution: do primitive hosts harbor primitive parasites? *Cladistics* 4: 339–366.
- Hedges SB, Marin J, Suleski M, Paymer M, Kumar S. 2015. Tree of life reveals clock-like speciation and diversification. *Molecular Biology and Evolution* 32: 835–845.
- Henk DA, Vilgalys R. 2007. Molecular phylogeny suggests a single origin of insect symbiosis in the Pucciniomycetes with support for some relationships within the genus *Septobasidium. American Journal of Botany* 94: 1515–1526.
- Hennen JF, Buriticá P. 1980. A brief summary of modern rust taxonomic and evolutionary theory. *Reports of the Tottori Mycological Institute* 18: 243–256.
- Ho SYM. 2007. Calibrating molecular estimates of substitution rates and divergence times in birds. *Journal of Avian Biology* 38: 409–414.
- Katoh K, Asimenos G, Toh H. 2009. Multiple alignment of DNA sequences with MAFFT. In: Posada D, ed. *Bioinformatics for DNA sequence analysis*. New York, NY, USA: Humana Press, 39–64.
- Kinloch BB. 2003. White pine blister rust in north america: past and prognosis. *Phytopathology* 93: 1044–1047.
- Leppik EE. 1953. Some viewpoints on the phylogeny of rust fungi I. Coniferous rusts. *Mycologia* 45: 46–74.

- Leppik EE. 1965. Some viewpoints on the phylogeny of rust fungi. V. Evolution of biological specialization. *Mycologia* 57: 6–22.
- Liberato JR, McTaggart AR, Shivas RG. 2014. First report of Masseeëlla capparis in Australia. Australasian Plant Disease Notes 9: 121.
- Liu K, Warnow TJ, Holder MT, Nelesen SM, Yu J, Stamatakis AP, Linder CR. 2012. SATe-II: very fast and accurate simultaneous estimation of multiple sequence alignments and phylogenetic trees. *Systematic Biology* 61: 90–106.
- Lutz M, Bauer R, Begerow D, Oberwinkler F. 2004. Tuberculina– Thanatophytuml Rhizoctonia crocorum–Helicobasidium: a unique mycoparasitic– phytoparasitic life strategy. Mycological Research 108: 227–238.
- Magallón S, Hilu KW, Quandt D. 2013. Land plant evolutionary timeline: gene effects are secondary to fossil constraints in relaxed clock estimation of age and substitution rates. *American Journal of Botany* 100: 556–573.
- Maier W, McTaggart AR, Roux J, Wingfield MJ. 2015. Phakopsora myrtacearum sp. nov., a newly described rust (Pucciniales) on eucalypts in eastern and southern Africa. Plant Pathology. doi: 10.1111/ppa.12406
- Mao K, Milne RI, Zhang L, Peng Y, Liu J, Thomas P, Mill RR, Renner S. 2012. Distribution of living Cupressaceae reflects the breakup of Pangea. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences*, USA 109: 7793– 7798.
- McTaggart AR, Doungsa-ard C, Geering ADW, Aime MC, Shivas RG. 2015. A co-evolutionary relationship exists between *Endoraecium* (Pucciniales) and its *Acacia* hosts in Australia. *Persoonia* 35: 50–62.
- McTaggart AR, Geering ADW, Shivas RG. 2013. *Thekopsora minima* causes blueberry rust in south-eastern Queensland and northern New South Wales. *Australasian Plant Disease Notes* **8**: 81–83.
- McTaggart AR, Geering ADW, Shivas RG. 2014. The rusts on Goodeniaceae and Stylidiaceae. *Mycological Progress* 13: 1017–1025.
- van der Merwe MM, Walker J, Ericson L, Burdon JJ. 2008. Coevolution with higher taxonomic host groups within the *Puccinial Uromyces* rust lineage obscured by host jumps. *Mycological Research* 112: 1387–1408.
- Miller JT, Murphy DJ, Ho SYW, Cantrill DJ, Seigler D. 2013. Comparative dating of *Acacia*: combining fossils and multiple phylogenies to infer ages of clades with poor fossil records. *Australian Journal of Botany* 61: 436–445.
- Nylander JAA, Wilgenbusch JC, Warren DL, Swofford DL. 2008. AWTY (are we there yet?): a system for graphical exploration of MCMC convergence in Bayesian phylogenetics. *Bioinformatics* 24: 581–583.
- Pegg GS, Giblin FR, McTaggart AR, Guymer GP, Taylor H, Ireland KB, Shivas RG, Perry S. 2014. *Puccinia psidii* in Queensland, Australia: disease symptoms, distribution and impact. *Plant Pathology* 63: 1005–1021.
- Peterson RS. 1974. Rust fungi with *Caeoma*-like sori on conifers. *Mycologia* 66: 242–255.
- Rambaut A, Suchard MA, Xie D, Drummond AJ 2014. *Tracer v1.6*. [WWW document] URL http://beast.bio.ed.ac.uk/Tracer. [accessed 17 July 2015].
- Ronquist F, Huelsenbeck JP. 2003. MrBayes 3: Bayesian phylogenetic inference under mixed models. *Bioinformatics* 19: 1572–1574.
- **Roy BA. 2001.** Patterns of association between Crucifers and their flower-mimic pathogens: host jumps are more common than coevolution or cospeciation. *Evolution* **55**: 41–53.
- Sauquet H, Ho SYW, Gandolfo MA, Jordan GJ, Wilf P, Cantrill DJ, Bayly MJ, Bromham L, Brown GK, Carpenter RJ et al. 2012. Testing the impact of calibration on molecular divergence times using a fossil-rich group: the case of Nothofagus (Fagales). Systematic Biology 61: 289–313.
- Savile DBO. 1971. Coevolution of the rust fungi and their hosts. *The Quarterly Review of Biology* 46: 211–218.
- Savile DBO. 1976. Evolution of the rust fungi (Uredinales) as reflected by their ecological problems. In: Hecht M, Steere W, Wallace B, eds. *Evolutionary biology*. New York, NY, USA: Springer, 137–207.
- Savile DBO. 1979. Fungi as aids in higher plant classification. *Botanical Review* 45: 377–503.
- Scholler M, Aime MC. 2006. On some rust fungi (Uredinales) collected in an Acacia koa–Metrosideros polymorpha woodland, Mauna Loa Road, Big Island, Hawaii. Mycoscience 47: 159–165.

- Scholler M, Lutz M, Wood A, Hagedorn G, Mennicken M. 2011. Taxonomy and phylogeny of *Puccinia lagenophorae*: a study using rDNA sequence data, morphological and host range features. *Mycological Progress* 10: 175–187.
- Shivas RG, Beasley DR, McTaggart AR. 2014. Online identification guides for Australian smut fungi (Ustilaginomycotina) and rust fungi (Pucciniales). *IMA Fungus* 5: 195–202.
- Sjamsuridzal W, Nishida H, Ogawa H, Kakishima M, Sugiyama J. 1999. Phylogenetic positions of rust fungi parasitic on ferns: evidence from 18S rDNA sequence analysis. *Mycoscience* 40: 21–27.
- Stamatakis A. 2014. RAxML Version 8: a tool for phylogenetic analysis and postanalysis of large phylogeneis. *Bioinformatics* 30: 1312–1313.
- Tiffney BH, Barghoorn ES. 1974. The fossil record of the fungi. Occasional Papers of the Farlow Herbarium of Cryptogamic Botany 7: 1–42.
- Vialle A, Feau N, Allaire M, Didukh M, Martin F, Moncalvo J-M, Hamelin RC. 2009. Evaluation of mitochondrial genes as DNA barcode for Basidiomycota. *Molecular Ecology Resources* 9: 99–113.
- de Vienne DM, Refregier G, Lopez-Villavicencio M, Tellier A, Hood ME, Giraud T. 2013. Cospeciation vs host-shift speciation: methods for testing, evidence from natural associations and relation to coevolution. *New Phytologist* 198: 347–385.
- Wingfield BD, Ericson L, Szaro T, Burdon JJ. 2004. Phylogenetic patterns in the Uredinales. *Australasian Plant Pathology* 33: 327–335.

About New Phytologist

- New Phytologist is an electronic (online-only) journal owned by the New Phytologist Trust, a not-for-profit organization dedicated to the promotion of plant science, facilitating projects from symposia to free access for our Tansley reviews.
- Regular papers, Letters, Research reviews, Rapid reports and both Modelling/Theory and Methods papers are encouraged. We are committed to rapid processing, from online submission through to publication 'as ready' via *Early View* – our average time to decision is <27 days. There are **no page or colour charges** and a PDF version will be provided for each article.
- The journal is available online at Wiley Online Library. Visit **www.newphytologist.com** to search the articles and register for table of contents email alerts.
- If you have any questions, do get in touch with Central Office (np-centraloffice@lancaster.ac.uk) or, if it is more convenient, our USA Office (np-usaoffice@lancaster.ac.uk)
- For submission instructions, subscription and all the latest information visit www.newphytologist.com