# Life histories of two arid-zone shrubs change with differences in habitat, grazing and climate 

P. Norman ${ }^{\text {A,C }}$, R. Denham ${ }^{\text {A }}$ and M. J. Calvert ${ }^{\text {B }}$<br>${ }^{\text {A }}$ Department of Science, Information Technology, Innovation and the Arts, Brisbane, Qld 4001, Australia.<br>${ }^{\text {B }}$ Department of Agriculture Fisheries and Forestry, Brisbane, Qld 4001, Australia.<br>${ }^{\text {C }}$ Corresponding author. Email: phil.norman@science.dsitia.qld.gov.au


#### Abstract

Shrubs are an important component of vegetation throughout the world. They are particularly significant in semiarid environments where they can dominate, driving ecosystem structure and functioning, and shaping land use. Lifehistory information was derived for Eremophila sturtii R.Br. and Dodonaea viscosa subsp. angustissima J.G.West, two widespread and common shrubs of semiarid eastern Australia. Plants growing under background climatic conditions took between 2 and 4 years to become established, attained the capacity to reproduce sexually at between 10 and 12 years, were in a sexually reproductive stage for between 17 and 28 years and lived an average maximum of $33-40$ years. Under background climatic conditions between 70 and $80 \%$ of plants that entered the juvenile stage survived to sexual maturity while under severe drought this proportion fell to between 40 and $60 \%$. Juvenile plants, particularly of $E$. sturtii, experienced the highest mortality under background conditions while, when exposed to severe drought, older plants, particularly $D$. viscosa subsp. angustissima in the intermediate stage, experienced the greatest increase in mortality, dying at more than twice the background rate. The high survival rates of $E$. sturtii and $D$. viscosa subsp. angustissima shown here, even under extreme drought conditions and in grazed- and ungrazed areas, help to explain why these shrub species have been observed to dominate vegetation in large areas of eastern Australia.


Additional keywords: development stage, establishment, life span, mortality rate, stage-classified matrix models.
Received 13 June 2013, accepted 21 March 2014, published online 28 April 2014

## Introduction

Shrubs are a widespread and significant component of vegetation globally (McKell 1989). In Australia $\sim 0.33$ of the area of remaining native vegetation is of types that are characterised by the presence of a shrub layer (National Vegetation Information System 2012). Shrubs are particularly significant in semiarid environments where they often represent the greatest proportion of perennial plant mass (McArthur and Kitchen 2007). Shrubs of semiarid environments are significant ecologically and economically. Shrubs play important roles in protecting soil (Maestre et al. 2009), sequestering carbon (Ruiz-Peinado et al. 2013), and conserving nutrients (Howard et al. 2012) and water (Zhang et al. 2013). Shrubs can shape the structure of semiarid vegetation, moderating what is otherwise a hostile environment to create nurseries for regeneration of other plant species (Jankju 2013), as well as providing food resources and shelter for invertebrate (Shelef and Groner 2011) and vertebrate (Mabry 2013) fauna. Shrubs provide fruits and nuts for human consumption (Miller and Gross 2011), fuel for heating and cooking (Young et al. 1989), building materials (e.g. Clarke et al. 1996) and browse for domestic livestock (e.g. Augustine and McNaughton 2004; Papanastasis et al. 2008).

Some semiarid shrubs are known for their propensity to regenerate densely and dominate or 'encroach' vegetation that would otherwise be open and contain a more diverse mix of plant life forms (Fuhlendorf 1999). Shrub encroachment has been widely observed in semiarid areas around the world (Van Auken 2000; Roques et al. 2001; Maestre et al. 2009). Opinions have converged around the general drivers of encroachment (Heisler et al. 2003; McKeon et al. 2004; Briske et al. 2005; Graz 2008) and debate continues about the site- and species-specific processes involved (e.g. Tighe et al. 2009; Muñoz-Robles et al. 2011), the impact (Eldridge et al. 2011), for example on biodiversity (e.g. Ayers et al. 2001; Doerr et al. 2009), and on how to respond (Khairo et al. 2008). The propensity for some plants to invade or encroach and the impact of encroachment has been associated with a range of physiological attributes including small seeds, high fecundity, and long-range dispersal (Rejmánek and Richardson 1996; Roques et al. 2001; Grotkopp et al. 2002), ability to resprout (Gibson et al. 2011), resilience to disturbance (Fuhlendorf 1999), continuity of shoot and root architecture (Maestre et al. 2009), and allelopathy (Eldridge et al. 2011). Lifehistory attributes are fundamental to the ecology of individual organisms and populations generally (Schweingruber and

Poschlod 2005) and attributes, such as rapid growth (Herron et al. 2007) and long life span (van Kleunen et al. 2010), have also been associated with propensity to invade or encroach. Information about shrub life history such as life span, duration of breeding and time to establishment, is important for the understanding of the dynamics of semiarid vegetation generally and encroachment in particular.

Eremophila sturtii R.Br. (hereafter Eremophila) and Dodonaea viscosa subsp. angustissima J.G.West (hereafter Dodonaea) are two large (up to $5-\mathrm{m}$ tall) wide-ranging and common shrubs (Cunningham et al. 1992) that are endemic to semiarid eastern Australia (West 1984; Harrington 2008). Both species can occur as scattered individuals in grassy open woodland or as dominant components of shrublands, particularly following disturbance (Cunningham et al. 1992; Richmond and Chinnock 1994; Chinnock 2007). Domination by these shrubs has been observed to occur across large areas (e.g. Gardiner et al. 1998) and has been found to have caused social and economic disadvantage (Anon. 1901, 1969; Harrington et al. 1979). Grazing by domestic livestock, mainly sheep, is the major use of land within the distribution of these two species (Hodgkinson 1979). Domination by these shrubs is widely believed to have a negative impact on grazing (Hodgkinson 1979; Scanlan et al. 1994; Chinnock 2007; Cunningham 2008), which has led to them being the subject of study in the past (e.g. Hodgkinson and Beetson 1995). Past research on these species has however focussed mainly on early stages in their life cycle (e.g. Booth et al. 1996a, 1996b), or on the short-term response of plants to treatments of control (e.g. Hodgkinson 1991) to develop strategies to prevent their establishment and domination. Growth and mortality of these two species over their full life cycle is unknown.

The opportunity to study the life histories of Eremophila and Dodonaea came about through a long-term study established in western New South Wales, Australia in 1980. This study was originally established to investigate the phenology and regeneration of the two species and the impacts of livestock grazing over the short term (Booth 1985). The study has continued to be monitored irregularly over subsequent years, during which the growth and mortality of a large number of individual plants have been recorded. Rainfall, and in particular drought, has been shown to be a major driver of semiarid woody plant demographics in other parts of Australia (e.g. Fensham and Holman 1999) and elsewhere in the world (Bowers 2005). However, the impact of drought on these two species has not been comprehensively investigated. The occurrence of a particularly severe and widespread drought throughout eastern Australia in the early 2000s (van Dijk et al. 2013) provided an opportunity to fill that knowledge gap.

The aims of this study were therefore to:

- quantify growth rates and death rates of Eremophila and Dodonaea under different habitats and livestock grazing, and
- investigate the impact of severe drought on their mortality and how this changes in relation to developmental stage, habitat and livestock grazing.
The implications of these findings are discussed in relation to the overall behaviour of populations of these two species and for land management.


## Materials and methods

Study area
The study site lies in western New South Wales, 16 km NW of the township of Bourke at an elevation of approximately 100 m a.s.l. on the edge of the Darling River floodplain. It is part of a large pastoral property, and adjoins a public stock droving route. Bourke experiences a dry sub-tropical climate. Summers are hot (mean daily maximum and minimum temperatures in January are 36.3 and $21.0^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$, respectively), and relatively wet (the highest mean monthly rainfall is 42.2 mm in February) while winters are cool (mean daily maximum and minimum temperatures in July are 17.9 and $4.9^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$, respectively), and relatively dry (the lowest mean monthly rainfall is 19.9 mm in September) (Australian Bureau of Meteorology 2012). Mean annual rainfall is 354.7 mm and is extremely variable ranging from the lowest recorded of 86.4 mm in 2002 to the highest of 854.6 mm in 1950 .

The site was selected because it was considered at the time that the study was established (in 1980) to be representative of a land type (the East Toorale Land System) where shrub domination was widespread and increasing (Booth and Barker 1979). The site is a mix of level to undulating sandplain rising on one side to a sandhill, which is up to 5 m higher than the surrounding landscape. The soil is infertile and poorly structured, varying from deep and unconsolidated sand on the sandhill to shallow compacted sandy loam overlaying a massive clay loam sub-soil on the sandplain. As is the pattern throughout the region, Dodonaea dominates on the deeper lighter sandhill soils while Eremophila dominates on the heavier sandplain soils. Approximately half the area of the site, including representative portions of both habitats, is enclosed by a livestock and feral grazing animal-proof fence. Shrubs were measured in groups of three belt transects each $50 \times 3 \mathrm{~m}$. Each group of transects was located in a different part of the landscape. The coordinates of individual shrubs were recorded and each was fitted with a numbered metal tag to allow identification at different sampling times. The site description, layout and field sampling method are detailed in Booth (1985) and Booth et al. (1996a, 1996b). It is acknowledged that the treatments are pseudo-replicates (sensu. Hurlbert 1984) and consequently statistical inferences, in particular with respect to the effect of grazing treatments, must be interpreted with caution. However, the large size of the sample and the extended period and number of occasions over which measurements were made mean that useful conclusions can still be reached.

## Measurements and analytical approach

The height and condition of individual plants were recorded on 17 irregularly spaced occasions between 1980 and 2008. Plants were included in the study on the occasion that they were first detected and remeasured on each subsequent occasion until they died or the study ended. A total of 2508 different plants were measured at least twice each across the life of the study. The plants measured comprised almost equal numbers of each species and included the range of sizes of shrubs present at the site. Each measure of each plant was assigned to a life stage according to definitions based on species and height (see Table 1) developed from published information (e.g. Booth 1985; Booth et al. 1996a, 1996b) and personal observations.

Life-history attributes were then calculated with stageclassified matrix models (Cochran and Ellner 1992; Ehrlen and Lehtila 2002; Allcock and Hik 2004) using the 'msm' package in $R$ (Jackson 2011). This approach is well suited to the data from this study as it is able to model observations that are irregularly spaced through time and data that are right-censored and/or left-truncated (Jackson 2011). The primary output from 'msm' is a table of transition intensity values (Appendix 1), which reflect the probability that individuals will move between different states. Functions available within 'msm' can be then used to estimate the duration of, and mortality during, different life stages and for subsets of the population defined by different combinations of covariates (Jackson 2011). Overall life span was defined as the average longevity of plants that reached the final, advanced mature, development stage. Species, habitat and grazing were included in the model as time-homogeneous covariates.

The relationship between rainfall and plant life history was investigated by including the Standardised Precipitation Index (SPI) (McKee et al. 1993; Guttman 1999) as an additional covariate. This index (Fig. 1) was calculated over a 24 -month window using monthly rainfall records recorded at Bourke since 1900 and analysed using an ' $R$ ' script previously developed for that purpose (Wheatley 2010). A 24-month window was chosen because it was considered to best represent moisture availability across the period considered most relevant to perennial woody vegetation (Quiring and Papakryiakou 2003). An SPI of -1.0 or less is considered to represent drought conditions (Guttman 1999). During the course of the study, SPI at Bourke fell below -1.0 for only comparatively brief periods prior to October 2002. In October 2002 however, it declined rapidly and remained between -1.0 and -2.5 until after the end of the study. This was
determined to best represent the period of the severe drought of the early 2000s. The impact of this drought was simulated by running ' msm ' with a piece-wise constant included at 22 years (October 2002) beyond which SPI was set to -1.5 representing a severe precipitation deficit. The non-drought years, including those with high rainfall, were designated 'background' climatic conditions and were modelled using SPI values as observed over these years.

## Results

How quickly do plants grow and how long do they live?
Under background climatic conditions, individuals of the two species studied established within 2-4 years; became sexually mature within $9-12$ years; spent between 17 and 28 years on average in sexual maturity; and lived an average maximum of 33-40 years (Table 2).

While the mean duration of each development stage differed considerably between combinations of species, habitats and grazing regimes in almost every instance, the variations around these means were high and as a result few of these differences were statistically significant. Statistically significant growth rate differences $(P \leq 0.05)$ were found only in the earlier stages of development. Eremophila exposed to grazing took significantly longer to establish than did the same species when protected from grazing, while Dodonaea growing on sandplain and protected from grazing took significantly longer to reach maturity than Eremophila growing on the same habitat and under the same grazing regime (Table 2). No instances were found of statistically significant differences in growth rates between plants of the same species, development stage and grazing regime that could be attributed to difference in habitat alone.

Table 1. Life stages identified in the development of Dodonaea and Eremophila at the study site

| Developmental stage | Description | Plant height (cm) |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  | Dodonaea | Eremophila |
| Seedling ${ }^{\text {A }}$ | Plant has a single soft and pliable stem and only one or two leaf whorls | 0-9.9 | 0-9.9 |
| Juvenile | Plant has a single (or several) stiff woody stems with few leaf whorls and no or limited woody branching | 10-24.9 | 10-24.9 |
| Intermediate | Plant starts to assume adult 'broombrush' form with multi-stems and complex stiff woody branching. This is the stage at which plants are recorded as established | 25-99.9 | 25-49.9 |
| Early mature | Plants are of adult form and are capable of flowering although flowering is irregular and is generally not abundant | 100-199.9 | 50-99.9 |
| Advanced mature | Plants are of adult form and flowering is regular and abundant. Larger plants may start to senesce with major branches collapsing and the crown dying back | $\geq 200$ | $\geq 100$ |
| Dead | Plants have no foliage and no live tissues are apparent | 0 | 0 |

[^0]

Fig. 1. 24-month Standardised Precipitation Index calculated using recorded monthly rainfall for Bourke from 1900 to 2011.

Differences in mortality rates were found to be statistically significant in a greater number of instances (Table 3). Juvenile and intermediate Eremophila died at significantly higher rates than did Dodonaea when growing on the same sandplain habitat and similarly protected from grazing. Advanced mature plants of Dodonaea, the only species to occur on both habitats, growing on sandplain died at significantly lower rates than the same species and development stage growing on sandhill whether exposed to grazing or when not grazed. No instances were found of statistically significant differences in mortality rates between plants of the same species, development stage and habitat that could be attributed to a difference in grazing regime alone.

Table 2. Mean duration (years) in various life-history stages

| Habitat | Grazing | Time to <br> establish | Time to <br> reach <br> maturity | Duration <br> of sexual <br> maturity | Total life <br> span |  |  |  |
| :--- | :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Sandhill | Not grazed | 2.0 | 11.8 | 21.6 | 33.3 |  |  |  |
| Sandhill | Grazed | 3.2 | 11.5 | 17.0 | 28.5 |  |  |  |
| Sandplain | Not grazed | 2.4 | 12.1 | 27.5 | 39.7 |  |  |  |
| Sandplain | Grazed | 3.6 | 12.5 | 23.5 | 35.9 |  |  |  |
|  |  | Eremophila |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Sandplain | Not grazed | 2.6 | $9.5^{\mathrm{A}}$ | 23.9 | 33.4 |  |  |  |
| Sandplain | Grazed | $3.7^{\mathrm{B}}$ | 9.7 | 22.3 | 32.0 |  |  |  |

${ }^{\text {A }}$ Duration for Eremophila is significantly less than for Dodonaea $(P \leq 0.05)$ for the same life-history stage, habitat and grazing regime.
${ }^{\mathrm{B}}$ Duration of grazed is significantly longer than not grazed ( $P \leq 0.05$ ) for the same life-history stage, species and habitat.

## How is plant mortality impacted by severe drought?

Under severe drought conditions mortality increased for all groups of plants and from all development stages (Table 3) although this difference was significant only for plants in the intermediate stage (all combinations of species, habitat and grazing history) and for Dodonaea in the early mature stage on either habitat and not grazed. The impact of drought on intermediate-stage plants was less for Eremophila, where mortality increased by $\sim 6$ times, compared with Dodonaea, for which mortality increased by between 12 and 26 times. For Dodonaea the impact of drought was less for plants in the early mature stage, for which mortality increased by between 3 and 4 times, than those in the intermediate stage. It was also less for those growing on sandplain, where mortality of intermediatestage plants increased by between 22 and 26 times, compared with sandhill, where mortality of plants in the same growth stage increased by between 12 and 22 times.

Between 58\% (for Eremophila either grazed or not grazed) and $40 \%$ (for Dodonaea on sandplain not grazed) of juvenile plants survived the 4 years of drought to reach sexual maturity while between $83 \%$ (for Dodonaea on sandhill grazed or not grazed) and $65 \%$ (for Eremophila not grazed) survived an equivalent period under background conditions.

## Discussion

We found that juveniles of both species establish quickly, in between 2 and 4 years, and that once plants reach the intermediate stage, annual mortality under background conditions is extremely low. This is similar to the observations of Booth (1985) that a sequence of just two consecutive summers of above-average rainfall is sufficient for a new cohort of these species to become

Table 3. Mean annual mortality rate for each combination of species, habitat, grazing regime and climate and for each development stage

| Habitat | Grazing | Climate | Mean annual mortality rate |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  |  | Juvenile | Intermediate | Early mature | Advanced mature |
| Dodonaea |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Sandhill | Not grazed | Background | 0.045 | 0.007 | 0.025 | 0.049 |
|  |  | Drought | 0.071 | $0.182^{\text {B }}$ | $0.096{ }^{\text {B }}$ | 0.090 |
| Sandhill | Grazed | Background | 0.042 | 0.008 | 0.046 | 0.043 |
|  |  | Drought | 0.050 | $0.174^{\text {B }}$ | 0.171 | 0.081 |
| Sandplain | Not grazed | Background | 0.057 | 0.009 | 0.016 | $0.029^{\text {C }}$ |
|  |  | Drought | 0.070 | $0.196{ }^{\text {B }}$ | $0.060^{\text {B }}$ | 0.054 |
| Sandplain | Grazed | Background | 0.053 | 0.009 | 0.028 | $0.026^{\text {C }}$ |
|  |  | Drought | 0.049 | $0.108^{\text {B }}$ | 0.107 | 0.049 |
| Eremophila |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Sandplain | Not grazed | Background | $0.097{ }^{\text {A }}$ | $0.018^{\text {A }}$ | 0.006 | 0.015 |
|  |  | Drought | 0.052 | $0.116^{\text {B }}$ | 0.026 | 0.027 |
| Sandplain | Grazed | Background | 0.088 | 0.018 | 0.011 | 0.013 |
|  |  | Drought | 0.040 | $0.108^{\text {B }}$ | 0.042 | 0.024 |

${ }^{\mathrm{A}}$ Mortality for Eremophila is significantly greater than for Dodonaea $(P \leq 0.05)$ for the same habitat, grazing regime, and climate.
${ }^{\mathrm{B}}$ Mortality under severe drought is significantly greater than under background climate conditions $(P \leq 0.05)$ for the same
species, habitat and grazing regime.
${ }^{\mathrm{C}}$ Mortality on sandplain is significantly less than on sandhill $(P \leq 0.05)$ for the same species, grazing regime, and climate.
established. These conditions occur on average about once each decade at Bourke. We also found that individuals of both species mature quickly and that, once mature, they live for a long time (between 17 and 28 years). This finding, together with the observations of Booth et al. (1996a) that Dodonaea flower and seed prolifically in most years once mature, means that once individuals reach sexual maturity, they will experience at least one or more likely two sets of conditions conducive to dense regeneration and recruitment during the period in which they have the capacity to produce seed. These life-cycle characteristics help explain the widely observed (e.g. Hodgkinson 1979) propensity of these species to encroach and dominate woodland vegetation throughout their range.

## How does life history vary between habitats?

Only one of the two species in this study, Dodonaea, occurred on both sandplain and sandhill habitat. We found that plants of this species in later development stages growing on sandhill experienced higher mortality than those on sandplain. This is despite our observations that both the overall density of shrub plants and the total volume of shrub canopy were less on the sandhill than on the sandplain, which indicate that plants growing on the sandhill experienced less competition than those on the sandplain. We suggest that the apparently contradictory result that mortality rates were higher for Dodonaea growing on sandhill may best be explained by the particular root growth characteristics of this species and differences in the landform and soils between the two habitats. Dodonaea develop vertical roots very quickly (reaching 12.5 cm after just 4 weeks and 117 cm after 14 weeks under controlled conditions) (Booth et al. 1996b). In the light soils of the sandhill, seedlings experience little physical resistance to root growth and are able to access and exploit moisture and nutrient resources required for survival and growth quickly. The heavy soils of the sandplain present considerable physical resistance to root growth retarding plant establishment and increasing the length of time for which seedlings remain vulnerable to moisture stress. However, once established, plants growing on the sandplain are able to access greater reserves of nutrients and water because this habitat is lower in the landscape and its soils retain water and nutrients more effectively increasing the capacity of plants on sandplain to survive the stresses of background climate variation. This result is similar to that of Browning et al. (2008) who, in a study of encroachment by mesquite in Arizona, found that, while conditions on sandy soils were suitable for shrub recruitment more frequently, woody plant growth was greater in the long-term on clayey soils due to their higher nutrient status and waterholding capacity.

## How does life history vary with exposure to livestock grazing?

Grazing had limited impact on plants in this study. The only statistically significant impact was that exposure to grazing slowed the development of juvenile plants of Eremophila. It is not surprising that grazing had a limited effect in a study of life history that focussed on latter stages in plant development especially since fire was absent throughout the study. Grazing is generally
believed to contribute to encroachment by favouring the survival and growth of shrub seedlings through suppression of other herbaceous species which would otherwise compete with shrub regeneration for scarce moisture and nutrients (Graz 2008). Grazing is also believed to reduce the frequency and intensity of fires, to which some shrubs, even in adult stages, are sensitive (Hodgkinson and Harrington 1985), by reducing overall fuel loads. The foliage of Eremophila is very aromatic, indicative of high essential oils content and graziers in the region report that it is rarely browsed except by goats (Cunningham 2008). That grazing alone (in the absence of fire) reduced the growth rate of juvenile Eremophila is unexpected and we are unable to offer an explanation.

## How does life history vary with exposure to drought?

Severe drought increased mortality for all groups of plants from all development stages. The effect was most significant on plants in the intermediate growth stage, less on Eremophila than on Dodonaea, more on sandhill than on sandplain, and did not distinguish between plants exposed to grazing and those that were not. Accelerated death of shrubs and trees of semiarid woodlands due to drought is widely documented throughout the world (e.g. Fensham and Holman 1999; Bowers 2005). That the most significant impact of drought in this study was on plants in the intermediate stage reflects a combination of the higher mortality experienced by juvenile plants under background conditions, as well as the greater resilience to drought of plants in more advanced stages. Fensham and Fairfax (2007) studied drought-related death of trees in central western Queensland in a semiarid environment similar to that of the study site. They found that death in drought conditions was greater for species with shallow root systems than those with taproots and that it increased with soil clay content. Our findings in relation to species and habitat appear to contradict these. Eremophila has a shallower and less complex root system than that of a Dodonaea (Booth et al. 1996b) and we found that, despite this, drought-caused mortality was higher in the latter species than the former. We believe that this apparently contradictory result was likely to be due to the superior ability of Eremophila to resprout after disturbance (Hodgkinson 1991) outweighing the effect of differences in root architecture on the respective ability of the two species to access water. We conclude that our similarly contradictory finding that deaths in drought conditions were greater on the sandhill with its much lighter soils reflects that landscape position was more influential on plant moisture availability in this study than differences in soil clay content.

## What are the implications for land management?

Our findings are similar to those of others (e.g. Harrington et al. 1979; McKeon et al. 2004) that the domination of vegetation by these shrubs can happen very quickly and that once established, shrub-dominated vegetation is very resilient. We found that plants of both species establish within 2-4 years, and that, once they have reached the intermediate stage, mortality of these plants under background conditions or with grazing, is low. Furthermore, we found that a severe drought alone is not sufficient to cause areas that have been encroached and become dominated
by mature shrubs of these species to become open. Even though mortality of established and mature plants increased significantly under severe drought, sufficient mature individuals survived in every combination of species, habitat and grazing regime to ensure that the population would retain the capacity to rapidly recolonise areas once conditions conducive to the survival and establishment of regeneration returned. Furthermore, as our results show, even in a drought as severe as that which occurred through the early 2000s in eastern Australia, a significant proportion of immature plants also survive.

## Conclusion

Individual plants of Dodonaea and Eremophila become established quickly and once they have become established will progress to sexual maturity. Even when exposed to exceptional drought conditions such as occurred in eastern Australia in the early 2000 s, around half of established plants will progress to maturity. Individuals that reach sexual maturity are long-lived and resilient to drought particularly when growing on the heavier soils of sandplain areas. Mature plants have the capacity to flower and seed prolifically and despite the highly variable climate in which these species live will experience at least one or possibly two sets of conditions conducive to dense regeneration and recruitment in their life time. Consequently, once vegetation is dominated by these shrubs, it will remain in that condition even when exposed to severe drought.

## Acknowledgements

C. A. (Sandy) Booth and other past and present staff of the (former) NSW Department of Soil Conservation and its successor organisations are thanked for establishing the study and undertaking previous measurements at the site. Daryl Green (former CEO Western CMA) is thanked for encouragement to revisit the study and John Lemon for assistance with fieldwork. Staff from Western CMA Bourke Office are thanked for hosting us while undertaking recent remeasures, as are also David Eldridge, Wal Whalley, and three anonymous reviewers for editorial advice.

## References

Allcock, K. G., and Hik, D. S. (2004). Survival, growth, and escape from herbivory are determined by habitat and herbivore species for three Australian woodland plants. Oecologia 138, 231-241. doi:10.1007/ s00442-003-1420-3
Anon. (1901). 'Report of the Royal Commission to Inquire Into the Condition of the Crown tenants, Western Division of New South Wales.' (Government Printer: Sydney, NSW.)
Anon. (1969). 'Report of the Inter-departmental Committee on Scrub and Timber Regrowth in the Cobar-Byrock District and Other Areas of the Western Division of New South Wales.' (Government Printer: Sydney, NSW.)
Augustine, D. J., and McNaughton, S. J. (2004). Regulation of shrub dynamics by native browsing ungulates on East African rangeland. Journal of Applied Ecology 41, 45-58. doi:10.1111/j.1365-2664.2004.00864.x
Australian Bureau of Meteorology (2012). Climate statistics for Australian locations. Available at: www.bom.gov.au/climate/averages/tables/cw_04 8013_All.shtml (accessed 2 April 2014).
Ayers, D., Melville, G., Bean, J., Beckers, D., Ellis, M., Mazzer, T., and Freudenberger, D. (2001). 'Woody Weeds, Biodiversity and Landscape Function in Western NSW.' (West 2000: Dubbo, NSW.)

Booth, C. A. (1985). Investigations of ecological factors affecting the establishment and survival of problem shrub species in the far west of New South Wales. MSc Thesis, University of NSW, Australia.
Booth, C. A., and Barker, P. J. (1979). 'Inedible shrub regeneration in the north-west corner of New South Wales.' Research Bulletin No. 13. (NSW Soil Conservation Service: Sydney, NSW.)
Booth, C. A., King, G. W., and Sanchez-Bayo, F. (1996a). Establishment of woody weeds in western New South Wales. 1. Seedling emergence and phenology. The Rangeland Journal 18, 58-79. doi:10.1071/ RJ9960058
Booth, C. A., Sanchez-Bayo, F., and King, G. W. (1996b). Establishment of woody weeds in western New South Wales. 2. Growth and competitive potential. The Rangeland Journal 18, 80-98. doi:10.1071/ RJ9960080
Bowers, J. E. (2005). Effects of drought on shrub survival and longevity in the northern Sonoran Desert. The Journal of the Torrey Botanical Society 132, 421-431.doi:10.3159/1095-5674(2005)132[421:EODOSS] 2.0.CO;2

Briske, D. D., Fuhlendorf, S. D., and Smeins, F. E. (2005). State-andTransition Models, thresholds, and rangeland health: a synthesis of ecological concepts and perspectives. Invited synthesis paper. Rangeland Ecology and Management 58, 1-10. doi:10.2111/1551-5028(2005)58<1: SMTARH $>2.0 . \mathrm{CO} ; 2$
Browning, D. M., Archer, S. V., Asner, G. P., McClaran, M. P., and Wessman, C. A. (2008). Woody plants in grasslands: post-encroachment stand dynamics. Ecological Applications 18, 928-944. doi:10.1890/07-1559.1
Chinnock, R. J. (2007). 'Eremophila and Allied Genera: a Monograph of the Plant Family Myoporaceae.' 1st edn. (Rosenberg Publishing Pty Ltd: Dural Delivery Centre, NSW.)
Clarke, J., Cavendish, W., and Coote, C. (1996). Rural households and miombo woodlands: use, value and management. In: 'The Miombo in Transition: Woodlands and Welfare in Africa'. (Ed. B. Campbell.) pp. 100-135. (Centre for International Forestry Research: Bogor, Indonesia.)
Cochran, M. E., and Ellner, S. (1992). Simple methods for calculating agebased life history parameters for stage-structured populations. Ecological Monographs 62, 345-364. doi:10.2307/2937115
Cunningham, G. (2008). 'Listening to the managers: a report on the invasive native scrub 'landholder knowledge' project.' A report prepared for the Central West Catchment Management Authority and Western Catchment Management Authority, Dubbo, NSW. (Geoff Cunningham Natural Resource Consultants Pty Ltd: Killara, NSW.)
Cunningham, G. M., Mulham, W. E., Milthorpe, P. L., and Leigh, J. H. (1992). 'Plants of Western New South Wales.' (Inkata Press: Melbourne, Vic.)
Doerr, V. A. J., Doerr, E. D., McIntyre, S., Stol, J., Davies, M., Drew, A., Warren, G., Moore, D., and Howling, G. (2009). 'Managing invasive native scrublands for improved biodiversity outcomes in agricultural landscapes.' Report to the Central West Catchment Management Authority, Dubbo. (CSIRO: Melbourne, Vic.)
Ehrlen, J., and Lehtila, K. (2002). How perennial are perennial plants? Oikos 98, 308-322. doi:10.1034/j.1600-0706.2002.980212.x
Eldridge, D. J., Bowker, M. A., Maestre, F. T., Roger, E., Reynolds, J. F., and Whitford, W. G. (2011). Impacts of shrub encroachment on ecosystem structure and functioning: towards a global synthesis. Ecology Letters 14, 709-722. doi:10.1111/j.1461-0248.2011.01630.x
Fensham, R. J., and Fairfax, R. J. (2007). Drought-related tree death of savanna eucalypts: species susceptibility, soil conditions and root architecture. Journal of Vegetation Science 18, 71-80. doi:10.1111/ j.1654-1103.2007.tb02517.x

Fensham, R. J., and Holman, J. E. (1999). Temporal and spatial patterns in drought-related tree dieback in Australian savanna. Journal of Applied Ecology 36, 1035-1050. doi:10.1046/j.1365-2664.1999.00460.x
Fuhlendorf, S. D. (1999). Ecological considerations for woody plant management. Rangelands 21, 12-15.

Gardiner, D. B., Tupper, G. J., and Dudgeon, G. S. (1998). A quantitative appraisal of woody shrub encroachment in western New South Wales. The Rangeland Journal 20, 26-40. doi:10.1071/ RJ9980026
Gibson, M. R., Richardson, D. M., Marchante, E., Marchante, H., Rodger, J. G., Stone, G. N., Byrne, M., Fuentes-Ramírez, A., George, N., Harris, C., Johnson, S. D., Le Roux, J. J., Miller, J. T., Murphy, D. J., Pauw, A., Prescott, M. N., Wandrag, E. M., and Wilson, J. R. U. (2011). Reproductive biology of Australian acacias: important mediator of invasiveness? Diversity \& Distributions 17, 911-933. doi:10.1111/ j.1472-4642.2011.00808.x

Graz, F. P. (2008). The woody weed encroachment puzzle: gathering pieces. Ecohydrology 1, 340-348. doi:10.1002/eco. 28
Grotkopp, E., Rejmánek, M., and Rost, T. L. (2002). Toward a causal explanation of plant invasiveness: seedling growth and life-history strategies of 29 pine (Pinus) species. American Naturalist 159, 396-419. doi:10.1086/338995
Guttman, N. B. (1999). Accepting the standardized precipitation index: a calculation algorithm. Journal of the American Water Resources Association 35, 311-322. doi:10.1111/j.1752-1688.1999.tb03592.x
Harrington, M. (2008). Phylogeny and evolutionary history of Sapindaceae and Dodonaea. PhD Thesis, James Cook University, Australia.
Harrington, G. N., Oxley, R. E., and Tongway, D. J. (1979). The effects of European settlement and domestic livestock on the biological system in poplar box (Eucalyptus populnea) lands. The Australian Rangeland Journal 4, 271-279.
Heisler, J. L., Briggs, J. M., and Knapp, A. K. (2003). Long-term patterns of shrub expansion in a C4-dominated grassland: fire frequency and the dynamics of shrub cover and abundance. American Journal of Botany 90, 423-428. doi:10.3732/ajb.90.3.423
Herron, P. M., Martine, C. T., Latimer, A. M., and Leitch-Young, S. A. (2007). Invasive plants and their ecological strategies: prediction and explanation of woody plant invasion in New England. Diversity \& Distributions 13, 633-644. doi:10.1111/j.1472-4642.2007.00381.x
Hodgkinson, K. C. (1979). The shrubs of poplar box (Eucalyptus populnea) lands and their biology. The Australian Rangeland Journal 4, 280-293.
Hodgkinson, K. C. (1991). Shrub recruitment response to intensity and season of fire in a semi-arid woodland. Journal of Applied Ecology 28, 60-70. doi:10.2307/2404113
Hodgkinson, K. C., and Beetson, G. R. (1995). Eremophila mitchellii Benth. In: 'The Biology of Australian Weeds, Vol. 1'. (Eds R. H. Groves, R. C. H. Shepherd and R. G. Richardson.) pp. 123-135. (R.G. and F. J. Richardson: Meredith, Vic.)

Hodgkinson, K. C., and Harrington, G. N. (1985). The case for prescribed burning to control shrubs in eastern semi-arid woodlands. The Australian Rangeland Journal 7, 64-74. doi:10.1071/RJ9850064
Howard, K. S. C., Eldridge, D. J., and Soliveres, S. (2012). Positive effects of shrubs on plant species diversity do not change along a gradient in grazing pressure in an arid shrubland. Basic and Applied Ecology 13, 159-168. doi:10.1016/j.baae.2012.02.008
Hurlbert, S. H. (1984). Pseudoreplication and the design of ecological field experiments. Ecological Monographs 54, 187-211. doi:10.2307/ 1942661
Jackson, C. H. (2011). Multi-state models for panel data: the msm package for R. Journal of Statistical Software 38, 1-29.
Jankju, M. (2013). Role of nurse shrubs in restoration of an arid rangeland: effects of microclimate on grass establishment. Journal of Arid Environments 89, 103-109. doi:10.1016/j.jaridenv.2012.09.008
Khairo, S. A., Mullen, J. D., Hacker, R. B., and Patton, D. P. (2008). 'Farming systems in the pastoral zone of NSW: an economic analysis.' NSW Department of Primary Industries, Economic Research Report No. 31. (NSW Department of Primary Industries: Trangie, NSW.)

Mabry, C. (2013). Optimal shrub density for bird habitat in the Mid-western United States. Ecological Research 31, 63-68. doi:10.3368/er.31.1.63
Maestre, F. T., Bowker, M. A., Puche, M. D., Hinojosa, M. B., Martinez, I., Garcia-Palacios, P., Castillo, A. P., Soliveres, S., Luzuriaga, A. L., Sanchez, A. M., Carreira, J. A., Gallardo, A., and Escudero, A. (2009). Shrub encroachment can reverse desertification in semi-arid Mediterranean grasslands. Ecology Letters 12, 930-941. doi:10.1111/ j.1461-0248.2009.01352.x

McArthur, E. D., and Kitchen, S. G. (2007). Shrubland ecosystems: importance, distinguishing characteristics, and dynamics. In: ‘Shrubland Dynamics - Fire and Water. Proceedings RMRS-P-47'. (Eds R. E. Sosebee, D. B. Wester, C. M. Britton, E. D. McArthur and S. G. Kitchen.) pp. 3-10. (U.S. Department of Agriculture, Forest Service, Rocky Mountain Research Station: Fort Collins, Co.)
McKee, T. B., Doesken, N. J., and Kleist, J. (1993). The relationship of drought frequency and duration to time scales. In: 'Proceedings of the 8th Conference on Applied Climatology'. Anaheim, California. pp. 179-184. (American Meteorological Society: Boston, MA.)
McKell, C. M. (1989). 'The Biology and Utilization of Shrubs.' (Academic Press Inc.: San Diego, CA.)
McKeon, G., Hall, W., Henry, B., Stone, G., and Watson, I. (2004). 'Pasture Degradation and Recovery in Australia's Rangelands: Learning from History.' (Department of Natural Resources Mines and Energy Queensland: Brisbane, Qld.)
Miller, A. J., and Gross, B. L. (2011). From forest to field: perennial fruit crop domestication. American Journal of Botany 98, 1389-1414. doi:10.3732/ ajb. 1000522
Muñoz-Robles, C., Reid, N., Tighe, M., Briggs, S. V., and Wilson, B. (2011). Soil hydrological and erosional responses in patches and inter-patches in vegetation states in semi-arid Australia. Geoderma 160, 524-534. doi:10.1016/j.geoderma.2010.10.024
National Vegetation Information System (2012). 'Australia - Present Major Vegetation Groups - NVIS Version 4.1 (Albers 100 m analysis product).' (Department of Environment: Canberra, ACT.)
Papanastasis, V. P., Yiakoulaki, M. D., Decandia, M., and Dini-Papanastasi, O. (2008). Integrating woody species into livestock feeding in the Mediterranean areas of Europe. Animal Feed Science and Technology 140, 1-17. doi:10.1016/j.anifeedsci.2007.03.012
Quiring, S. M., and Papakryiakou, T. N. (2003). An evaluation of agricultural drought indices for the Canadian prairies. Agricultural and Forest Meteorology 118, 49-62. doi:10.1016/S0168-1923(03)00072-8
Rejmánek, M., and Richardson, D. M. (1996). What attributes make some plant species more invasive? Ecology 77, 1655-1661. doi:10.2307/ 2265768
Richmond, G. S., and Chinnock, R. J. (1994). Seed germination of the Australian desert shrub Eremophila (Myoporaceae). Botanical Review 60, 483-503. doi:10.1007/BF02857928
Roques, K. G., O'Connor, T. G., and Watkinson, A. R. (2001). Dynamics of shrub encroachment in an African savanna: relative influences of fire, herbivory, rainfall and density dependence. Journal of Applied Ecology 38, 268-280. doi:10.1046/j.1365-2664.2001.00567.x
Ruiz-Peinado, R., Moreno, G., Juarez, E., Montero, G., and Roig, S. (2013). The contribution of two common shrub species to above-ground and below-ground carbon stock in Iberian dehesas. Journal of Arid Environments 91, 22-30. doi:10.1016/j.jaridenv.2012.11.002
Scanlan, J. C., McKeon, G. M., Day, K. A., Mott, J. J., and Hinton, A. W. (1994). Estimating safe carrying capacities of extensive cattlegrazing properties within tropical, semi-arid woodlands of northeastern Australia. The Rangeland Journal 16, 64-76. doi:10.1071/ RJ9940064
Schweingruber, F. H., and Poschlod, P. (2005). Growth rings in herbs and shrubs: life-span, age determination and stem anatomy. Forest Snow and Landscape Research 79, 195-415.

Shelef, O., and Groner, E. (2011). Linking landscape and species: effect of shrubs on patch preference of beetles in arid and semi-arid ecosystems. Journal of Arid Environments 75, 960-967. doi:10.1016/j.jaridenv. 2011. 04.016

Tighe, M., Reid, N., Wilson, B., and Briggs, S. V. (2009). Invasive native scrub and soil condition in semi-arid south-eastern Australia. Agriculture, Ecosystems \& Environment 132, 212-222. doi:10.1016/j.agee.2009. 04.001

Van Auken, O. W. (2000). Shrub invasions of North American semi-arid grasslands. Annual Review of Ecology and Systematics 31, 197-215. doi:10.1146/annurev.ecolsys.31.1.197
van Dijk, A. I. J. M., Beck, H. E., Crosbie, R. S., de Jeu, R. A. M., Liu, Y. Y., Podger, G. M., Timbal, B., and Viney, N. R. (2013). The Millennium Drought in south-east Australia (2001-2009): natural and human causes and implications for water resources, ecosystems, economy and society. Water Resources Research 49, 1040-1057. doi:10.1002/wrer. 20123
van Kleunen, M., Weber, E., and Fischer, M. (2010). A meta-analysis of trait differences between invasive and non-invasive plant species. Ecology Letters 13, 235-245. doi:10.1111/j.1461-0248.2009.01418.x
West, J. G. (1984). A revision of Dodonaea Miller (Sapindaceae) in Australia. Brunonia 7, 1-194. doi:10.1071/BRU9840001
Wheatley, J. (2010). Standardized Precipitation Index. Available at: http:// joewheatley.net/visualizing-drought/ (accessed 2 April 2014).
Young, J. A., Budy, J. D., and Evans, R. A. (1989). Use of shrubs for fuel. In: 'The Biology and Utilization of Shrubs'. (Ed. C. M. McKell.) pp. 479-492. (Academic Press Inc.: San Diego, CA.)
Zhang, Y., Wang, X., Hu, R., Pan, Y., and Zhang, H. (2013). Stem-flow in two xerophytic shrubs and its significance to soil water and nutrient enrichment. Ecological Research 28, 567-579. doi:10.1007/s11284-013-1046-9

Appendix 1. Maximum likelihood estimates (with $95 \%$ confidence limits) for the stage-classified matrix model with the covariates: Species, Standardised Precipitation Index, Habitat and Grazing
Transition intensity matrix with covariates set to their means

| To from | Juvenile | Intermediate | Early mature | Advanced mature | Dead |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Juvenile | $\begin{gathered} -0.3947 \\ (-0.4197,-0.3713) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} 0.2887 \\ (0.2675,0.3114) \end{gathered}$ | 0 | 0 | $\begin{gathered} 0.1061 \\ (0.0940,0.1196) \end{gathered}$ |
| Intermediate | $\begin{gathered} 0.1902 \\ (0.1711,0.2115) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} -0.3564 \\ (-0.3804,-0.334) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} 0.1566 \\ (0.145,0.1692) \end{gathered}$ | 0 | $\begin{gathered} 0.0096 \\ (0.0038,0.0243) \end{gathered}$ |
| Early mature | 0 | $\begin{gathered} 0.0531 \\ (0.0456,0.0617) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} -0.186 \\ (-0.1997,-0.1733) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} 0.1127 \\ (0.103,0.1232) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} 0.0203 \\ (0.0134,0.0309) \end{gathered}$ |
| Advanced mature | 0 | 0 | $\begin{gathered} 0.01727 \\ (0.0142,0.0207) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} -0.0360 \\ (-0.0404,-0.0321) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} 0.0188 \\ (0.0159,0.0224) \end{gathered}$ |
| Dead | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |

Log-linear effects of Species: Eremophila

| To from | Juvenile | Intermediate | Early mature | Advanced mature |  |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Juvenile | 0 | -0.2347 | 0 | 0 | 0.03474 |
| Intermediate | 1.427 | $(-0.411,-0.0583)$ | 0.5654 | 0 | $(-0.2696,0.3391)$ |
| Early mature | $(1.168,1.686)$ | 0 | $(0.3938,0.737)$ | -0.6511 |  |
| Advanced mature | 0 | 1.494 | 0 | 0.3363 |  |
|  | 0 | $(1.024,1.965)$ | -0.6676 | $(0.1114,0.5611)$ |  |
| Dead | 0 | 0 | $(-1.134,-0.2014)$ | 0 | $(-1.291,0.4144)$ |


| To from | Juvenile | Intermediate | Early mature | Advanced mature | Dead |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Juvenile | 0 | $\begin{gathered} -0.3241 \\ (-0.4334,-0.2149) \end{gathered}$ | 0 | 0 | $\begin{gathered} 0.6295 \\ (0.4883,0.7708) \end{gathered}$ |
| Intermediate | $\begin{gathered} 0.3497 \\ (0.2186,0.4808) \end{gathered}$ | 0 | $\begin{gathered} 0.0580 \\ (-0.0462,0.1623) \end{gathered}$ | 0 | $\begin{gathered} -1.803 \\ (-2.275,-1.332) \end{gathered}$ |
| Early mature | 0 | $\begin{gathered} 0.0552 \\ (-0.1409,0.2513) \end{gathered}$ | 0 | $\begin{gathered} 0.2158 \\ (0.0937,0.3379) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} -0.6924 \\ (-1.139,-0.2458) \end{gathered}$ |
| Advanced mature | 0 | 0 | $\begin{gathered} -0.6514 \\ (-0.8834,-0.4194) \end{gathered}$ | 0 | $\begin{gathered} -0.3052 \\ (-0.5197,-0.0907) \end{gathered}$ |
| Dead | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| Log-linear effects of Habitat: Plain |  |  |  |  |  |
| To from | Juvenile | Intermediate | Early mature | Advanced mature | Dead |
| Juvenile | 0 | $-0.2152(-0.5483,0.1178)$ | 0 | 0 | $\begin{gathered} 0.2067 \\ (-0.8855,1.299) \end{gathered}$ |
| Intermediate | $\begin{gathered} 1.062 \\ (0.3728,1.751) \end{gathered}$ | 0 | $\begin{gathered} -0.147 \\ (-0.4037,0.1097) \end{gathered}$ | 0 | $\begin{gathered} 0.1009 \\ (-0.3267,0.5286) \end{gathered}$ |
| Early mature | 0 | $-0.4074(-1.059,0.2444)$ | 0 | $\begin{gathered} 0.3512 \\ (-0.0299,0.7324) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} -0.4985 \\ (-1.168,0.1707) \end{gathered}$ |
| Advanced mature | 0 | 0 | $\begin{gathered} 0.0038 \\ (-0.5817,0.5893) \end{gathered}$ | 0 | $\begin{gathered} -0.528 \\ (-0.9261,-0.1299) \end{gathered}$ |
| Dead | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |

Log-linear effects of Grazing: Grazed

| To from | Juvenile | Intermediate | Early mature | Advanced mature | Dead |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Juvenile | 0 | $\begin{gathered} 0.4817 \\ (0.301,0.6624) \end{gathered}$ | 0 | 0 | $\begin{gathered} 0.1442 \\ (-0.0548,0.3432) \end{gathered}$ |
| Intermediate | $\begin{gathered} -0.0586 \\ (-0.2596,0.1423) \end{gathered}$ | 0 | $\begin{gathered} -0.0021 \\ (-0.2111,0.2069) \end{gathered}$ | 0 | $\begin{gathered} 0.0748 \\ (-0.361,0.5106) \end{gathered}$ |
| Early mature | 0 | $\begin{gathered} 0.3229 \\ (-0.0274,0.6731) \end{gathered}$ | 0 | $\begin{gathered} -0.2164 \\ (-0.4233,-0.0095) \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} -0.6381 \\ (-1.32,0.0435) \end{gathered}$ |
| Advanced mature | 0 | 0 | $\begin{gathered} -0.0492 \\ (-0.4821,0.3837) \end{gathered}$ | 0 | $\begin{gathered} 0.1454 \\ (-0.1708,0.4616) \end{gathered}$ |
| Dead | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |

-2 * log-likelihood: 29309.


[^0]:    ${ }^{\text {A }}$ The seedling stage was not included in the analysis because seasonal variability and the irregularity of measurements meant that it was not adequately represented in the transitions observed, particularly in the latter stages of the study.

